Senior Design Program
Spring 2015 Best Paper Contest
Evaluation and Judging Form

Project ______________________________________
Evaluator ____________________________________

PAPER FORMAT
Students were provided the attached sample report as a model for structuring their papers. Each report should include:
   I. Cover/Title Page
   II. Abstract
   III. Table of Contents
   IV. List of Figures and Tables
   V. Introduction
   VI. Summary of Previous Work
   VII. Hardware, Software, and Mechanical Design, if applicable
   VIII. Conclusions and Future Work
   IX. References and/or Bibliography
   X. Required Appendices:
      A. Appendix A: Abbreviations;
      B. Appendix B: Budget;
      C. Appendix C: Different versions of the timeline and deliverables document;
   I. Optional Appendices:
      Other Appendices, as needed

JUDGING CRITERIA
Please provide scores for each question on the next page. Use the scale 1-10, where:

1 - Does not meet basic expectations  2 - Barely meets basic expectations  4 - Below average  6 - Average
8 - Above average                      10 - Exceptional

Please include any typed comments at the end of this document.
Please evaluate each of the sub-categories below on the scale 1-10 and type comments at the end of this document.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Context and Content</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Organization and Development</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consider the following factors:</td>
<td></td>
<td>Consider the following factors:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Concise, fully developed message</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Content organized in a coherent manner</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Message is clear to any audience, not just engineers</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Compliant with sample paper format</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Convinces and informs the reader</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Inclusive and accurate table of contents</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Analyzes, explores, and summarizes the topic</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Concise, informative abstract</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Originality of ideas, experimental procedures, processes, results, or conclusions</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Succinct introduction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Quality and level of technical content</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Logical development and analytical treatment in the body</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Factual and technical accuracy</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Comprehensive conclusion and clear summary of future work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grammar and Form</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Usage of figures and tables</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consider the following factors:</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Usage of references, citations, appendices, and acknowledgments</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Grammar and spelling</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Clearly defined and explained individual project roles</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Paragraph and sentence structure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Category**

**INFORMATION GATHERING**

(information has been identified and obtained to support design process and design decisions)
- Please consider sources used, quality of information gathered, and frequency of revisiting

**PROBLEM DEFINITION**

(the system, component, or process has been designed to meet client needs within realistic constraints, such as economic, environmental, social, political, ethical, health and safety, manufacturability and sustainability)

**IDEA GENERATION**

(new ideas and concepts have been considered in development of design)

**DESIGN QUALITY #1 – theory and equations**

(mathematics, science, and engineering theory and equations have been properly used)
- Please consider quality, completeness, and results

**DESIGN QUALITY #2 - tools**

(modern techniques and engineering tools have been used)
- Please consider quality, completeness, and results

**EVALUATION**

(appropriate methods and tools have been used to determine how well concepts meet requirements: design and conducting of experiments, analysis, interpretation, and validation of test results)

**ETHICAL DISCUSSION**

(ethical aspects have been considered during the course of the project and discussed in the report)

**BREADTH OF EDUCATION**

(impact of engineering solutions in a global, economic, environmental, and/or societal context has been discussed)

**CONTEMPORARY ISSUES**

(report reflects knowledge of contemporary issues)

**LIFE-LONG LEARNING**

(report shows recognition of the need to “stay current” with the emerging technologies and engage in life-long learning)

**MULTIDISCIPLINARY ASPECT**

(report shows recognition of the need for multidisciplinary interaction, or discusses the multidisciplinary aspect of the project)

**COMMUNICATION**

(written report effectively communicates design process and results to clients)

**OVERALL EVALUATION**